Fares and Ticketing Committee 18.2.10



Secretariat Memorandum	Agenda No : 8 FT39
Author : Tim Bellenger	Date : 29.1.10

Provision of ticket barriers at stations : a discussion of possible strategy

1 Purpose of report

1.1 To provide the basis for a discussion on the desirability of providing ticket barriers at stations.

2 Recommendations

- 2.1 Members are invited to note this report, and it is recommended that in future our aspirations for station facilities should be that all stations served by local services of at least one million passengers per annum installation of ticket gates is considered as a means of reducing fare evasion and associated levels of crime, and increasing levels of passenger satisfaction and staffing presence.
- 2.2 Members attention is also drawn to the geographic spread of the use of ticket barriers and that in the absence of a current gating strategy for London there would be appear to be an element of inequality of provision between relatively prosperous areas and those that are not.

3 Background

- 3.1 London Underground has for many years operated on the basis that almost all of their stations are provided with some form of ticker barrier or gate that is operated only when a passenger presents a valid ticket or Oyster card. This system was seen to provide a number of benefits, firstly in reducing ticket fraud, but also in reducing crime and anti-social behaviour on the network, as a result of the gates being in place and the associated staffing and surveillance that this either required or brought with it.
- 3.2 The Docklands Light Railway since its inception has adopted a different approach with only a small number of stations having ticket barriers, and relying mainly on on-board ticket inspections.
- 3.3 The National Rail network in contrast had since the late 1970s adopted a policy of 'open' stations rather than the previous arrangements which was to have a manual check of tickets at each exit. However from the 1990s onwards Network South East and later franchised train operators began to install ticket gates at a number of major stations in order to reduce ticket fraud.

- 3.4 The installation of these gates has been at the behest of individual train operators and there has been no London wide strategy or decision making process on where and when gates should be introduced. Initially the major London Termini with major flows of suburban traffic (such as Victoria or Liverpool Street) or outer London stations such as Bromley South or East Croydon were the first to be so treated. Largely these stations had similar profiles of users to that of the London Underground (indeed all stations with gates have to conform to London Underground standards as far as specification goes). Later, however, there has been a trend for operators to introduce gates at smaller stations and at stations or on platforms used by Inter-City or airport services.
- 3.5 This trend has raised a number of issues over the years some of which have been resolved but in other cases there is continuing dissatisfaction by passengers where the installation of gates has involved :
 - Closure of side entrances resulting in longer and more circuitous routes to and from the station. Examples of this have included New Malden, Lewisham, Forest Hill and Sydenham. In the case of Forest Hill and Sydenham it was eventually agreed to fund additional gatelines at the side entrances that had previously been proposed for closure;
 - Problems for passengers with luggage, travelling with bicycles or wheelchair users. These can be largely resolved by the use of wide aisle gates;
 - Installation of gates where a large proportion of passengers use tickets such as 'airline style' card or mobile phone bar codes, instead of conventional paper tickets or Oyster smartcards;
 - Installation of gates at stations in Greater London without Oyster compatibility, but where trains from Greater London area stations call, for example, St. Pancras International. At this station East Midlands Trains installed gates without Oyster at their platforms, which are also used by First Capital Connect trains in the evenings, weekends and at times of disruption. There is a problem for passengers who have Travelcards on Oyster who have purchased 'Boundary Zone' extension tickets to and from their destination. However, we have been recently informed that the gates will have an Oyster capability from around Easter 2010;
 - And problems for passengers travelling from stations where no ticket purchasing facilities were available and where no on board ticket selling has either taken place or is available.

4. The benefits of gating.

- 4.1 There have been a number of observable benefits from the introduction of ticket gates. These are :
 - Increased revenue for the train operator;
 - Reduced ticket fraud;
 - Reduction in crime levels on trains and in stations. Though this may be a function of increased staff presence as gates require staff to be deployed and be visible;
 - And increased satisfaction levels amongst passengers : in some cases the reduction in ticket fraud has not resulted in increased satisfaction amongst passengers, particularly in cases where large proportions of travellers had not previously been paying for their journey. An example given by London Underground concerned increased satisfaction levels on stations on the east end of the District line, where often gates were not fully

staffed at weekends and evenings, however once full staffing over all periods of the day was introduced, satisfaction levels increased dramatically as passenger felt more reassured by a staff presence.

5 Which stations are currently gated?

- 5.1 In London TravelWatch's remit area a total of 134 stations on the National Rail network are fully gated and a further 5 are partially gated (these include main line terminals such as Kings Cross and Paddington where some platforms are used by long distance and airport services). Victoria and Kings Cross will have further gating installed shortly (this will make Victoria fully gated). The distribution of the 134 stations shows 105 in the London Travelcard area and 29 outside. However, the geographic spread of such stations shows the divergent policies of different operators and franchise awards. Recent investment by Southern, South West Trains and the East London Line extension project means that a significant proportion of their inner London stations are gated. However, by contrast National Express East Anglia has apart from interchange stations with the Underground no stations in Inner London gated at all. Southeastern has some gating in outer London, but virtually none in inner London (Lewisham has interchange with the DLR and Peckham Rye was gated as part of the Southern franchise). First Capital Connect has gated significant numbers of stations in Hertfordshire and Bedfordshire, and its central London stations, but inner London has none except those run by other operators as an interchange. A full list of gated stations as shown as Appendix A, together with the recorded usage levels in 2007/08.
- 5.2 Ranked by usage it would appear that stations with over 1 million passenger journeys per year are most likely to be gated and by implication would be easier to justify investment in gating. The busiest ungated stations in the London TravelWatch area are Herne Hill, West Hampstead Thameslink, Denmark Hill, Wandsworth Town, Greenwich, Harpenden, Harold Wood, Hither Green, Blackheath, Gidea Park, Beckenham Junction, Worcester Park, Walton-on-Thames, Chessington South, Teddington, Bishops Stortford, Hampton Court, Hayes and Harlington, Walthamstow Central, Petts Wood, Mill Hill Broadway, Chadwell Heath, Grove Park and Egham in descending order. Stansted Airport is an exception : it is generally the practice not to gate airport stations because of the large numbers of people with luggage and foreign visitors unfamiliar with the network.
- 5.3 Those stations listed above are those with over two million users a year. There are however, a significant number of stations with and without gates in the banding of 1 to 2 million users per year. It is noticeable that of those stations that are not gated in this banding, a good proportion of these are in areas of high deprivation, for example, Edmonton Green, Goodmayes, Forest Gate, Southall, Barnehurst, Cheshunt, Catford Bridge, Leagrave, Palmers Green, St. Mary Cray, Seven Kings, Lee, Broxbourne, Charlton, Enfield Town, Plumstead, Hackney Downs, Loughborough Junction, Cricklewood, Manor Park, Alexandra Palace, Nunhead, Mottingham, Tooting, Deptford and Northolt Park. This compares with those stations that are gated and which tend to be in more affluent areas.
- 5.4 Comparisons with the ticketless travel survey for the South Central franchise as described at the previous meeting might suggest that similar levels of fare evasion might be occurring at the stations outlined in paragraph 5.2 and 5.3 above.

6 Representations from passengers

6.1 London TravelWatch has had a number of representations from passengers when gating schemes have been proposed and implemented. Principally these have involved the permanent closure of side entrances. We have also had representations where a large proportion of passenger use 'airline' style tickets on inter city routes. An example of this is attached as Appendix B.

7 Equalities and inclusion implications

- 7.1 The introduction of gating has a number of implications for people with disabilities which need to be taken of in terms of design of gates, but also of individual schemes especially where the decision is taken to reduce the numbers of entrances / exits to stations.
- 7.2 The geographic spread of gating and the associated staffing is a matter of concern, because it would appear that stations in more prosperous areas are more likely to be gated than those with lower levels of economic activity e.g. parts of East London, Harringey, Enfield and less prosperous areas of Ealing, Greenwich, Lewisham, Lambeth and Southwark.

8 Financial implications

8.1 The contents of this report have no specific financial implications for London TravelWatch.

9 Legal powers

9.1 Section 248 of the Greater London Authority Act 1999 places upon London TravelWatch (as the London Transport Users Committee) a duty to consider - and where it appears to the Committee to be desirable, to make recommendations with respect to - any matter affecting the functions of the Greater London Authority or Transport for London which relate to transport (other than of freight). Section 252A of the same Act places a duty upon it to keep under review matters affecting the interests of the public in relation to railway passenger and station services provided wholly or partly within the London railway area, and to make representations about them to such persons as it thinks appropriate.

Station	Gated	2007/08
Abbey Wood	yes	3,204,194
Acton Central	yes	1,009,246
Acton Main Line	no	364,265
Addlestone	no	387,906
Albany Park	yes	1,012,762
Alexandra Palace	no	1,266,503
Amersham	yes	675,426
Anerley	no	396,996
Angel Road	no	32,090
Apsley	no	405,780
Ashford (Surrey)	no	928,868
Ashtead	planned	1,035,665
Aylesbury	yes	1,129,973
Balham	yes	4,726,679
Banstead	no	105,664
Barking	yes	3,559,402
Barnehurst	no	1,692,901
Barnes	no	1,686,077
Barnes Bridge	no	467,295
Bat & Ball	no	107,680
Battersea Park	yes	1,668,236
Bayford	no	34,907
Beaconsfield	yes	1,272,423
Beckenham Hill	no	291,351
Beckenham Junction	no	2,742,891
Bedford	yes	3,184,488
Bellingham	no	644,620
Belmont	no	132,688

Station	Gated	2007/08
Belvedere	no	710,163
Berkhamsted	no	1,422,662
Berrylands	no	357,116
Bethnal Green	no	563,696
Bexley		1,234,010
	yes	
Bexleyheath	yes	3,379,428
Bicester North	no	910,506
Bickley	no	849,281
Birkbeck	no	33,409
Bishops Stortford	no	2,464,128
Blackfriars	yes	13,341,602
Blackheath	no	2,893,474
Blackhorse Road	yes	86,550
Bookham	no	248,785
Bowes Park	no	527,475
Boxhill & Westhumble	no	51,376
Brentford	no	1,048,304
Bricket Wood	no	56,540
Brimsdown	no	532,697
Brixton	no	669,271
Brockley	yes	2,008,237
Bromley North	no	661,536
Bromley South	yes	6,286,468
Brondesbury	yes	738,642
Brondesbury Park	no	528,708
Brookmans Park	no	185,759
Broxbourne	no	1,495,519
Bruce Grove	no	324,936

Station	Gated	2007/08
Bush Hill Park	no	697,913
Bushey	no	723,486
Byfleet & New Haw	no	409,799
Caledonian Road & Barnsbury	no	397,964
Cambridge Heath	no	137,617
Camden Road	yes	1,356,317
Cannon Street	yes	22,177,065
Canonbury	yes	477,914
Carpenders Park	no	151,327
Carshalton	yes	1,341,829
Carshalton Beeches	no	886,686
Castle Bar Park	no	113,977
Caterham	no	833,810
Catford	no	951,159
Catford Bridge	no	1,679,427
Chadwell Heath	no	2,073,727
Chalfont & Latimer	yes	141,858
Charing Cross	yes	39,063,680
Charlton	no	1,490,715
Cheam	no	1,247,318
Chelsfield	no	953,906
Chertsey	no	587,986
Cheshunt	no	1,692,201
Chessington North	no	590,320
Chessington South	no	2,607,840
Chingford	no	1,361,136
Chipstead	no	164,955
Chislehurst	no	1,209,216
Chiswick	no	759,576
Chorleywood	yes	168,532
City Thameslink	yes	6,733,713
Clandon	no	178,203

Station	Gated	2007/08
Clapham High Street	no	226,771
Clapham Junction	yes	19,881,295
Clapton	no	631,457
Claygate	no	589,341
Clock House	no	1,198,893
Cobham & Stoke d'Abernon	no	618,647
Coulsdon South	yes**	1,477,919
Crayford	yes	1,360,088
Crews Hill	no	55,119
Cricklewood	no	1,326,580
Crofton Park	no	621,846
Crouch Hill	no	152,633
Crystal Palace	yes	1,580,347
Cuffley	no	616,894
Dagenham Dock	yes	640,585
Dalston Kingsland	yes	1,733,409
Dartford	yes	3,311,472
Datchet	no	319,733
Denham	no	260,345
Denham Golf Club	no	17,213
Denmark Hill	no	3,921,594
Deptford	no	1,082,249
Dorking	planned	1,078,443
Drayton Green	no	80,987
Drayton Park	no	297,091
Dunton Green	no	107,654
Ealing Broadway	yes	3,506,892
Earlsfield	yes	5,385,289
Earlswood (Surrey)	no	351,722
East Croydon	yes	22,583,906
East Dulwich	no	1,510,169
Eden Park	no	512,832

Station	Gated	2007/08
Edmonton Green	no	1,989,956
Effingham Junction	no	301,515
Egham	no	2,023,075
Elephant & Castle	no	3,970,380
Elmers End	no	953,005
Elmstead Woods	no	1,223,315
Elstree & Borehamwood	yes	3,459,142
Eltham	yes	2,368,496
Emerson Park	no	56,141
Enfield Chase	no	1,132,694
Enfield Lock	no	857,351
Enfield Town	no	1,481,853
Epsom	yes	3,720,782
Epsom Downs	no	69,800
Erith	no	713,034
Esher	no	1,089,774
Essex Road	no	320,481
Euston	partial	29,341,182
Ewell East	no	425,032
Ewell West	no	1,002,572
Eynsford	no	153,102
Falconwood	yes	994,581
Farringdon	yes	1,706,195
Feltham	yes	3,373,810
Fenchurch Street	yes	15,976,407
Finchley Road & Frognal	no	552,282
Finsbury Park	partial	5,165,946
Flitwick	no	1,247,611
Forest Gate	no	1,740,837
Forest Hill	yes	2,987,068
Fulwell	no	482,495
Garston (Herts)	no	93,079

Station	Gated	2007/08
Gatwick Airport	yes**	12,729,627
Gerrards Cross	yes	1,115,291
Gidea Park	no	2,790,404
Gipsy Hill	yes**	1,762,673
Goodmayes	no	1,751,848
Gordon Hill	no	954,159
Gospel Oak	yes	922,699
Grange Park	no	277,001
Great Missenden	no	530,999
Greenford	yes	82,751
Greenwich	no	3,421,417
Grove Park	no	2,053,334
Gunnersbury	yes	881,386
Hackbridge	no	903,010
Hackney Central	yes	1,316,644
Hackney Downs	no	1,367,110
Hackney Wick	no	283,067
Haddenham & Thame Parkway	no	532,572
Hadley Wood	no	367,640
Hampstead Heath	yes	823,974
Hampton	no	1,214,106
Hampton Court	no	2,405,726
Hampton Wick	no	873,395
Hanwell	no	365,340
Harlesden	yes	326,704
Harlington (Beds)	no	329,257
Harlow Mill	no	147,282
Harlow Town	yes	1,712,840
Harold Wood	no	2,919,269
Harpenden	no	2,929,985
Harringay	no	988,657
Harringay Green Lanes	no	228,338

Station	Gated	2007/08
Harrow & Wealdstone	yes	1,305,647
Harrow-on-the Hill	yes	653,131
Hatch End	no	550,917
Hatfield	yes	1,768,214
Haydons Road	no	505,862
Hayes	no	1,122,309
Hayes & Harlington	no	2,209,949
Headstone Lane	no	1,256,142
Hemel Hempstead	yes	1,690,596
Hendon	no	1,154,049
Herne Hill	no	4,061,777
Hersham	no	675,132
Hertford East	no	613,405
Hertford North	yes	1,202,298
High Wycombe	yes	2,114,744
Highams Park	no	1,609,977
Highbury & Islington	yes	3,924,821
Hinchley Wood	no	328,078
Hither Green	no	2,901,002
Homerton	yes	1,248,036
Honor Oak Park	yes	1,514,419
Horley	planned	1,021,682
Hornsey	no	968,526
Horsley	no	365,342
Hounslow	no	1,101,010
How Wood	no	38,723
llford	yes	5,025,170
Imperial Wharf	yes	Not yet known
Isleworth	no	780,514
lver	no	147,920
Kempton Park	no	45,648
Kenley	no	514,172

Station	Gated	2007/08
Kensal Green	yes	482,883
Kensal Rise	no	666,261
Kensington Olympia	no	1,790,062
Kent House	no	819,031
Kentish Town	yes	1,110,875
Kentish Town West	no	512,346
Kenton	yes	318,257
Kew Bridge	no	754,798
Kew Gardens	yes	567,061
Kidbrooke	no	947,231
Kilburn High Road	no	916,456
Kings Cross	partial	24,629,269
Kings Langley	no	595,820
Kingston	yes	5,413,895
Kingswood	no	289,266
Knebworth	no	457,813
Knockholt	no	129,353
Ladywell	no	924,616
Langley	no	653,345
Leagrave	no	1,651,382
Leatherhead	planned	1,824,572
Lee	no	1,505,373
Lewisham	yes	8,247,628
Leyton Midland Road	no	224,047
Leytonstone High Road	no	196,728
Limehouse	yes	2,480,014
Little Kimble	no	6,334
Liverpool Street	yes	57,789,977
London Bridge	yes	54,124,745
London Fields	no	231,513
London Road (Guildford)	no	641,263
Loughborough Junction	no	1,362,855

Station	Gated	2007/08
Lower Sydenham	no	435,428
Luton	yes	3,548,183
Luton Airport Parkway	yes	2,628,187
Malden Manor	no	607,484
Manor Park	no	1,271,655
Maryland	no	407,857
Marylebone	yes	12,190,364
Maze Hill	no	831,113
Merstham	planned	610,118
Mill Hill Broadway	no	2,103,459
Mitcham Eastfields	no	Not yet known
Mitcham Junction	no	323,875
Monks Risborough	no	24,384
Moorgate	yes	10,151,649
Morden South	no	63,152
Mortlake	no	1,969,000
Motspur Park	no	1,188,173
Mottingham	no	1,233,259
New Barnet	no	990,104
New Beckenham	no	906,566
New Cross	yes	2,035,480
New Cross Gate	yes	1,963,129
New Eltham	yes	2,471,319
New Malden	yes	3,169,937
New Southgate	no	546,016
Norbiton	yes	2,351,202
Norbury	yes	2,477,628
North Dulwich	no	815,609
North Sheen	no	337,431
North Wembley	yes	229,706
Northolt Park	no	1,026,210
Northumberland Park	no	154,211

Station	Gated	2007/08
Norwood Junction	yes	2,810,444
Nunhead	no	1,244,557
Oakleigh Park	no	983,779
Old Street	yes	903,461
Orpington	yes	5,193,259
Otford	no	414,212
Oxshott	no	451,842
Oxted	planned	1,450,619
Paddington	partial	29,224,722
Palmers Green	no	1,608,412
Park Street	no	32,817
Peckham Rye	yes	2,811,004
Penge East	no	1,217,031
Penge West	no	264,535
Petts Wood	no	2,170,234
Plumstead	no	1,442,660
Ponders End	no	246,924
Potters Bar	yes	1,681,137
Princes Risborough	no	501,080
Purfleet	partial	433,480
Purley	yes	2,565,613
Purley Oaks	no	588,816
Putney	yes	13,980,442
Queens Park (London)	yes	1,564,018
Queens Road (Peckham)	no	726,862
Queenstown Road	yes	1,586,897
Radlett	no	1,053,143
Rainham (Essex)	yes	1,408,761
Ravensbourne	no	179,016
Raynes Park	yes	3,998,558
Rectory Road	no	347,604
Redhill	yes	3,565,089

Station	Gated	2007/08
Reedham (Surrey)	no	281,990
Richmond	yes	6,664,179
Rickmansworth	yes	100,085
Riddlesdown	no	344,779
Romford	yes	7,355,240
Roydon	no	100,351
Rye House	no	336,314
Salfords	no	116,602
Sanderstead	no	1,057,224
Saunderton	no	59,514
Sawbridgeworth	no	451,004
Seer Green & Jordans	no	134,825
Selhurst	yes	1,171,780
Seven Kings	no	1,517,666
Seven Sisters	yes	2,117,210
Sevenoaks	yes	4,004,789
Shepherds Bush	yes	Not yet known
Shepperton	no	442,807
Shoreham	no	32,053
Shortlands	no	1,401,592
Sidcup	yes	3,312,085
Silver Street	no	520,664
Slade Green	no	468,714
Slough	yes	4,879,229
Smitham	no	282,089
South Acton	no	278,194
South Bermondsey	no	547,371
South Croydon	yes	1,311,820
South Greenford	no	15,363
South Hampstead	no	382,574
South Kenton	no	57,108
South Merton	no	140,560

Station	Gated	2007/08
South Ruislip	yes	126,768
South Tottenham	no	183,840
Southall	no	1,693,659
Southbury	no	360,815
St Albans	yes	6,337,837
St Albans Abbey	no	222,482
St Helier	no	148,657
St James Street	no	600,899
St Johns	no	935,690
St Margarets (Greater London)	no	1,546,360
St Margarets (Herts)	no	313,656
St Mary Cray	no	1,545,380
St Pancras	yes	6,623,900
Staines	yes	2,629,739
Stamford Hill	no	939,067
Stansted Airport	no	5,521,687
Stansted Mountfitchet	no	383,993
Stevenage	yes	4,206,418
Stoke Mandeville	no	309,449
Stoke Newington	no	396,108
Stonebridge Park	yes	483,538
Stoneleigh	no	1,266,859
Stratford	yes	11,272,959
Strawberry Hill	no	1,007,356
Streatham	yes	2,407,173
Streatham Common	yes	3,008,626
Streatham Hill	yes**	2,143,966
Sudbury & Harrow Road	no	40,431
Sudbury Hill Harrow	no	362,079
Sunbury	no	458,341
Sundridge Park	no	366,104
Sunnymeads	no	22,936

Station	Gated	2007/08
Surbiton	yes	9,660,885
Sutton	yes	6,613,872
Sutton Common	no	266,412
Swanley	no	1,350,373
Sydenham	yes	2,211,353
Sydenham Hill	no	561,501
Syon Lane	no	652,716
Tadworth	no	244,276
Tattenham Corner	no	229,638
Teddington	no	2,497,909
Thames Ditton	no	901,933
Theobalds Grove	no	222,252
Thornton Heath	yes	2,410,315
Tolworth	no	489,142
Tooting	no	1,177,145
Tottenham Hale	no	3,588,183
Tring	no	587,473
Tulse Hill	yes	1,967,901
Turkey Street	no	457,977
Twickenham	yes	4,943,798
Upminster	yes	2,616,561
Upper Halliford	no	168,789
Upper Holloway	no	204,715
Upper Warlingham	no	639,477
Vauxhall	yes	15,015,459
Victoria	yes**	77,462,118
Virginia Water	no	520,911
Waddon	no	603,501
Wallington	yes	1,961,314
Waltham Cross	no	704,582
Walthamstow Central	no	2,204,729
Walthamstow Queens Road	no	68,681

Station	Gated	2007/08
Walton-on-Thames	no	2,612,224
Wandsworth Common	no	1,491,918
Wandsworth Road	no	182,059
Wandsworth Town	no^^	3,836,172
Wanstead Park	no	147,521
Ware	no	904,420
Waterloo	yes	100,306,690
Waterloo East	partial	7,046,020
Watford High Street	yes	446,040
Watford Junction	yes	4,445,087
Watford North	no	98,875
Watton at Stone	no	124,202
Welham Green	no	147,553
Welling	yes	2,300,820
Welwyn Garden City	yes	2,502,254
Welwyn North	no	455,322
Wembley Central	yes	1,006,939
Wembley Stadium	no	677,845
Wendover	no	405,247
West Brompton	yes	632,970
West Byfleet	no	1,140,339
West Croydon	yes	2,571,880
West Drayton	no	1,284,139
West Dulwich	no	908,877
West Ealing	no	1,129,455
West Ham	yes	1,176,240
West Hampstead	yes	1,108,126
West Hampstead Thameslink	no	4,006,121
West Norwood	yes	1,638,122
West Ruislip	yes	140,849
West Sutton	no	281,716
West Wickham	no	1,003,311

Station	Gated	2007/08
Westcombe Park	no	910,689
Weybridge	yes	2,697,472
White Hart Lane	no	615,997
Whitton	no	1,351,965
Whyteleafe	no	331,764
Whyteleafe South	no	118,523
Willesden Junction	yes	215,464
Wimbledon	yes	15,783,913
Wimbledon Chase	no	334,691
Winchmore Hill	no	1,325,757
Windsor & Eton Central	no	1,508,501
Windsor & Eton Riverside	no	1,257,388
Woking	yes	7,509,561
Woldingham	no	244,813
Wood Street	no	652,531

Station	Gated	2007/08
Woodgrange Park	no	115,969
Woodmansterne	no	337,330
Woolwich Arsenal	yes	2,312,923
Woolwich Dockyard	no	418,072
Worcester Park	no	2,717,774
Worplesdon	no	191,359
Wraysbury	no	71,915

** = gates to be installed in 2010 (including gating remaining

platforms at London Victoria) ^ = SWT have previously suggested that gates would be installed at Wandsworth Town

Stations by order of usage

Station	Gated	2007/08
Imperial Wharf	yes	Not yet known
Mitcham Eastfields	no	Not yet known
Shepherds Bush	yes	Not yet known
Little Kimble	no	6,334
South Greenford	no	15,363
Denham Golf Club	no	17,213
Sunnymeads	no	22,936
Monks Risborough	no	24,384
Shoreham	no	32,053
Angel Road	no	32,090
Park Street	no	32,817
Birkbeck	no	33,409
Bayford	no	34,907
How Wood	no	38,723
Sudbury & Harrow Road	no	40,431
Kempton Park	no	45,648
Boxhill & Westhumble	no	51,376
Crews Hill	no	55,119
Emerson Park	no	56,141
Bricket Wood	no	56,540
South Kenton	no	57,108
Saunderton	no	59,514
Morden South	no	63,152
Walthamstow Queens Road	no	68,681
Epsom Downs	no	69,800
Wraysbury	no	71,915
Drayton Green	no	80,987
Greenford	yes	82,751
Blackhorse Road	yes	86,550

Station	Gated	2007/08
Garston (Herts)	no	93,079
Watford North	no	98,875
Rickmansworth	yes	100,085
Roydon	no	100,351
Banstead	no	105,664
Dunton Green	no	107,654
Bat & Ball	no	107,680
Castle Bar Park	no	113,977
Woodgrange Park	no	115,969
Salfords	no	116,602
Whyteleafe South	no	118,523
Watton at Stone	no	124,202
South Ruislip	yes	126,768
Knockholt	no	129,353
Belmont	no	132,688
Seer Green & Jordans	no	134,825
Cambridge Heath	no	137,617
South Merton	no	140,560
West Ruislip	yes	140,849
Chalfont & Latimer	yes	141,858
Harlow Mill	no	147,282
Wanstead Park	no	147,521
Welham Green	no	147,553
lver	no	147,920
St Helier	no	148,657
Carpenders Park	no	151,327
Crouch Hill	no	152,633
Eynsford	no	153,102
Northumberland Park	no	154,211

Station	Gated	2007/08
Chipstead	no	164,955
Chorleywood	yes	168,532
Upper Halliford	no	168,789
Clandon	no	178,203
Ravensbourne	no	179,016
Wandsworth Road	no	182,059
South Tottenham	no	183,840
Brookmans Park	no	185,759
Worplesdon	no	191,359
Leytonstone High Road	no	196,728
Upper Holloway	no	204,715
Willesden Junction	yes	215,464
Theobalds Grove	no	222,252
St Albans Abbey	no	222,482
Leyton Midland Road	no	224,047
Clapham High Street	no	226,771
Harringay Green Lanes	no	228,338
Tattenham Corner	no	229,638
North Wembley	yes	229,706
London Fields	no	231,513
Tadworth	no	244,276
Woldingham	no	244,813
Ponders End	no	246,924
Bookham	no	248,785
Denham	no	260,345
Penge West	no	264,535
Sutton Common	no	266,412
Grange Park	no	277,001
South Acton	no	278,194
West Sutton	no	281,716
Reedham (Surrey)	no	281,990
Smitham	no	282,089

Station	Gated	2007/08
Hackney Wick	no	283,067
Kingswood	no	289,266
Beckenham Hill	no	291,351
Drayton Park	no	297,091
Effingham Junction	no	301,515
Stoke Mandeville	no	309,449
St Margarets (Herts)	no	313,656
Kenton	yes	318,257
Datchet	no	319,733
Essex Road	no	320,481
Mitcham Junction	no	323,875
Bruce Grove	no	324,936
Harlesden	yes	326,704
Hinchley Wood	no	328,078
Harlington (Beds)	no	329,257
Whyteleafe	no	331,764
Wimbledon Chase	no	334,691
Rye House	no	336,314
Woodmansterne	no	337,330
North Sheen	no	337,431
Riddlesdown	no	344,779
Rectory Road	no	347,604
Earlswood (Surrey)	no	351,722
Berrylands	no	357,116
Southbury	no	360,815
Sudbury Hill Harrow	no	362,079
Acton Main Line	no	364,265
Hanwell	no	365,340
Horsley	no	365,342
Sundridge Park	no	366,104
Hadley Wood	no	367,640
South Hampstead	no	382,574

Station	Gated	2007/08
Stansted Mountfitchet	no	383,993
Addlestone	no	387,906
Stoke Newington	no	396,108
Anerley	no	396,996
Caledonian Road & Barnsbury	no	397,964
Wendover	no	405,247
Apsley	no	405,780
Maryland	no	407,857
Byfleet & New Haw	no	409,799
Otford	no	414,212
Woolwich Dockyard	no	418,072
Ewell East	no	425,032
Purfleet	partial	433,480
Lower Sydenham	no	435,428
Shepperton	no	442,807
Watford High Street	yes	446,040
Sawbridgeworth	no	451,004
Oxshott	no	451,842
Welwyn North	no	455,322
Knebworth	no	457,813
Turkey Street	no	457,977
Sunbury	no	458,341
Barnes Bridge	no	467,295
Slade Green	no	468,714
Canonbury	yes	477,914
Fulwell	no	482,495
Kensal Green	yes	482,883
Stonebridge Park	yes	483,538
Tolworth	no	489,142
Princes Risborough	no	501,080
Haydons Road	no	505,862
Kentish Town West	no	512,346

Station	Gated	2007/08
Eden Park	no	512,832
Kenley	no	514,172
Silver Street	no	520,664
Virginia Water	no	520,911
Bowes Park	no	527,475
Brondesbury Park	no	528,708
Great Missenden	no	530,999
Haddenham & Thame Parkway	no	532,572
Brimsdown	no	532,697
New Southgate	no	546,016
South Bermondsey	no	547,371
Hatch End	no	550,917
Finchley Road & Frognal	no	552,282
Sydenham Hill	no	561,501
Bethnal Green	no	563,696
Kew Gardens	yes	567,061
Tring	no	587,473
Chertsey	no	587,986
Purley Oaks	no	588,816
Claygate	no	589,341
Chessington North	no	590,320
Kings Langley	no	595,820
St James Street	no	600,899
Waddon	no	603,501
Malden Manor	no	607,484
Merstham	planned	610,118
Hertford East	no	613,405
White Hart Lane	no	615,997
Cuffley	no	616,894
Cobham & Stoke d'Abernon	no	618,647
Crofton Park	no	621,846
Clapton	no	631,457

Station	Gated	2007/08
West Brompton	yes	632,970
Upper Warlingham	no	639,477
Dagenham Dock	yes	640,585
London Road (Guildford)	no	641,263
Bellingham	no	644,620
Wood Street	no	652,531
Syon Lane	no	652,716
Harrow-on-the Hill	yes	653,131
Langley	no	653,345
Bromley North	no	661,536
Kensal Rise	no	666,261
Brixton	no	669,271
Hersham	no	675,132
Amersham	yes	675,426
Wembley Stadium	no	677,845
Bush Hill Park	no	697,913
Waltham Cross	no	704,582
Belvedere	no	710,163
Erith	no	713,034
Bushey	no	723,486
Queens Road (Peckham)	no	726,862
Brondesbury	yes	738,642
Kew Bridge	no	754,798
Chiswick	no	759,576
Isleworth	no	780,514
North Dulwich	no	815,609
Kent House	no	819,031
Hampstead Heath	yes	823,974
Maze Hill	no	831,113
Caterham	no	833,810
Bickley	no	849,281
Enfield Lock	no	857,351

Station	Gated	2007/08
Hampton Wick	no	873,395
Gunnersbury	yes	881,386
Carshalton Beeches	no	886,686
Thames Ditton	no	901,933
Hackbridge	no	903,010
Old Street	yes	903,461
Ware	no	904,420
New Beckenham	no	906,566
West Dulwich	no	908,877
Bicester North	no	910,506
Westcombe Park	no	910,689
Kilburn High Road	no	916,456
Gospel Oak	yes	922,699
Ladywell	no	924,616
Ashford (Surrey)	no	928,868
St Johns	no	935,690
Stamford Hill	no	939,067
Kidbrooke	no	947,231
Catford	no	951,159
Elmers End	no	953,005
Chelsfield	no	953,906
Gordon Hill	no	954,159
Hornsey	no	968,526
Oakleigh Park	no	983,779
Harringay	no	988,657
New Barnet	no	990,104
Falconwood	yes	994,581
Ewell West	no	1,002,572
West Wickham	no	1,003,311
Wembley Central	yes	1,006,939
Strawberry Hill	no	1,007,356
Acton Central	yes	1,009,246

Station	Gated	2007/08
Albany Park	yes	1,012,762
Horley	planned	1,021,682
Northolt Park	no	1,026,210
Ashtead	planned	1,035,665
Brentford	no	1,048,304
Radlett	no	1,053,143
Sanderstead	no	1,057,224
Dorking	planned	1,078,443
Deptford	no	1,082,249
Esher	no	1,089,774
Hounslow	no	1,101,010
West Hampstead	yes	1,108,126
Kentish Town	yes	1,110,875
Gerrards Cross	yes	1,115,291
Hayes	no	1,122,309
West Ealing	no	1,129,455
Aylesbury	yes	1,129,973
Enfield Chase	no	1,132,694
West Byfleet	no	1,140,339
Hendon	no	1,154,049
Selhurst	yes	1,171,780
West Ham	yes	1,176,240
Tooting	no	1,177,145
Motspur Park	no	1,188,173
Clock House	no	1,198,893
Hertford North	yes	1,202,298
Chislehurst	no	1,209,216
Hampton	no	1,214,106
Penge East	no	1,217,031
Elmstead Woods	no	1,223,315
Mottingham	no	1,233,259
Bexley	yes	1,234,010

Station	Gated	2007/08
Nunhead	no	1,244,557
Cheam	no	1,247,318
Flitwick	no	1,247,611
Homerton	yes	1,248,036
Headstone Lane	no	1,256,142
Windsor & Eton Riverside	no	1,257,388
Alexandra Palace	no	1,266,503
Stoneleigh	no	1,266,859
Manor Park	no	1,271,655
Beaconsfield	yes	1,272,423
West Drayton	no	1,284,139
Harrow & Wealdstone	yes	1,305,647
South Croydon	yes	1,311,820
Hackney Central	yes	1,316,644
Winchmore Hill	no	1,325,757
Cricklewood	no	1,326,580
Carshalton	yes	1,341,829
Swanley	no	1,350,373
Whitton	no	1,351,965
Camden Road	yes	1,356,317
Crayford	yes	1,360,088
Chingford	no	1,361,136
Loughborough Junction	no	1,362,855
Hackney Downs	no	1,367,110
Shortlands	no	1,401,592
Rainham (Essex)	yes	1,408,761
Berkhamsted	no	1,422,662
Plumstead	no	1,442,660
Oxted	planned	1,450,619
Coulsdon South	yes**	1,477,919
Enfield Town	no	1,481,853
Charlton	no	1,490,715

Station	Gated	2007/08
Wandsworth Common	no	1,491,918
Broxbourne	no	1,495,519
Lee	no	1,505,373
Windsor & Eton Central	no	1,508,501
East Dulwich	no	1,510,169
Honor Oak Park	yes	1,514,419
Seven Kings	no	1,517,666
St Mary Cray	no	1,545,380
St Margarets (Greater London)	no	1,546,360
Queens Park (London)	yes	1,564,018
Crystal Palace	yes	1,580,347
Queenstown Road	yes	1,586,897
Palmers Green	no	1,608,412
Highams Park	no	1,609,977
West Norwood	yes	1,638,122
Leagrave	no	1,651,382
Battersea Park	yes	1,668,236
Catford Bridge	no	1,679,427
Potters Bar	yes	1,681,137
Barnes	no	1,686,077
Hemel Hempstead	yes	1,690,596
Cheshunt	no	1,692,201
Barnehurst	no	1,692,901
Southall	no	1,693,659
Farringdon	yes	1,706,195
Harlow Town	yes	1,712,840
Dalston Kingsland	yes	1,733,409
Forest Gate	no	1,740,837
Goodmayes	no	1,751,848
Gipsy Hill	yes**	1,762,673
Hatfield	yes	1,768,214
Kensington Olympia	no	1,790,062

Station	Gated	2007/08
Leatherhead	planned	1,824,572
Wallington	yes	1,961,314
New Cross Gate	yes	1,963,129
Tulse Hill	yes	1,967,901
Mortlake	no	1,969,000
Edmonton Green	no	1,989,956
Brockley	yes	2,008,237
Egham	no	2,023,075
New Cross	yes	2,035,480
Grove Park	no	2,053,334
Chadwell Heath	no	2,073,727
Mill Hill Broadway	no	2,103,459
High Wycombe	yes	2,114,744
Seven Sisters	yes	2,117,210
Streatham Hill	yes**	2,143,966
Petts Wood	no	2,170,234
Walthamstow Central	no	2,204,729
Hayes & Harlington	no	2,209,949
Sydenham	yes	2,211,353
Welling	yes	2,300,820
Woolwich Arsenal	yes	2,312,923
Norbiton	yes	2,351,202
Eltham	yes	2,368,496
Hampton Court	no	2,405,726
Streatham	yes	2,407,173
Thornton Heath	yes	2,410,315
Bishops Stortford	no	2,464,128
New Eltham	yes	2,471,319
Norbury	yes	2,477,628
Limehouse	yes	2,480,014
Teddington	no	2,497,909
Welwyn Garden City	yes	2,502,254

Station	Gated	2007/08
Purley	yes	2,565,613
West Croydon	yes	2,571,880
Chessington South	no	2,607,840
Walton-on-Thames	no	2,612,224
Upminster	yes	2,616,561
Luton Airport Parkway	yes	2,628,187
Staines	yes	2,629,739
Weybridge	yes	2,697,472
Worcester Park	no	2,717,774
Beckenham Junction	no	2,742,891
Gidea Park	no	2,790,404
Norwood Junction	yes	2,810,444
Peckham Rye	yes	2,811,004
Blackheath	no	2,893,474
Hither Green	no	2,901,002
Harold Wood	no	2,919,269
Harpenden	no	2,929,985
Forest Hill	yes	2,987,068
Streatham Common	yes	3,008,626
New Malden	yes	3,169,937
Bedford	yes	3,184,488
Abbey Wood	yes	3,204,194
Dartford	yes	3,311,472
Sidcup	yes	3,312,085
Feltham	yes	3,373,810
Bexleyheath	yes	3,379,428
Greenwich	no	3,421,417
Elstree & Borehamwood	yes	3,459,142
Ealing Broadway	yes	3,506,892
Luton	yes	3,548,183
Barking	yes	3,559,402
Redhill	yes	3,565,089

Station	Gated	2007/08
Tottenham Hale	no	3,588,183
Epsom	yes	3,720,782
Wandsworth Town	no^^	3,836,172
Denmark Hill	no	3,921,594
Highbury & Islington	yes	3,924,821
Elephant & Castle	no	3,970,380
Raynes Park	yes	3,998,558
Sevenoaks	yes	4,004,789
West Hampstead Thameslink	no	4,006,121
Herne Hill	no	4,061,777
Stevenage	yes	4,206,418
Watford Junction	yes	4,445,087
Balham	yes	4,726,679
Slough	yes	4,879,229
Twickenham	yes	4,943,798
llford	yes	5,025,170
Finsbury Park	partial	5,165,946
Orpington	yes	5,193,259
Earlsfield	yes	5,385,289
Kingston	yes	5,413,895
Stansted Airport	no	5,521,687
Bromley South	yes	6,286,468
St Albans	yes	6,337,837
Sutton	yes	6,613,872
St Pancras	yes	6,623,900
Richmond	yes	6,664,179
City Thameslink	yes	6,733,713
Waterloo East	partial	7,046,020
Romford	yes	7,355,240
Woking	yes	7,509,561
Lewisham	yes	8,247,628
Surbiton	yes	9,660,885

Station	Gated	2007/08
Moorgate	yes	10,151,649
Stratford	yes	11,272,959
Marylebone	yes	12,190,364
Gatwick Airport	yes**	12,729,627
Blackfriars	yes	13,341,602
Putney	yes	13,980,442
Vauxhall	yes	15,015,459
Wimbledon	yes	15,783,913
Fenchurch Street	yes	15,976,407
Clapham Junction	yes	19,881,295
Cannon Street	yes	22,177,065
East Croydon	yes	22,583,906
Kings Cross	partial	24,629,269
Paddington	partial	29,224,722
Euston	partial	29,341,182
Charing Cross	yes	39,063,680
London Bridge	yes	54,124,745
Liverpool Street	yes	57,789,977
Victoria	yes**	77,462,118
Waterloo	yes	100,306,690

** = gates to be installed in 2010 (including gating remaining platforms at London Victoria)

 $^{\wedge}$ = SWT have previously suggested that gates would be installed at Wandsworth Town

Appendix **B**

Example of casework correspondence

Email from Mr M :

"Have you made any headway with this? It seems to me that St Pancras, both the EMT side and now SE HS, are significantly degraded for the passenger. The barriers are dysfunctional and there are neglible customer facilities at platform concourse level.

Have you also been consulted on the King's Cross barrier proposals, which we are now told are to be brought forward? This scheme is also seriously flawed in concept and will seriously detract from what is meant to be a "World Class" project (like St Pancras).

Mr M"

2 October 2009

"Dear Mr M

Points raised by Mr M missed in replies from East Midlands Trains

Thank you for your email.

I've passed your comments to our Director of Public Liaison and Transport Policy Assistant for their information.

Yours sincerely

Margaret Croucher Casework Officer info7@londontravelwatch.org.uk"

"Dear Margaret Croucher

Thanks for following this up. I am interested, but not surprised, to learn that you were not consulted in an adequate manner on the St Pancras gating scheme. If it had been put to the committee properly I am sure that some of the issues I am complaining of and we are discussing might have been looked at more carefully.

The scheme was put into a franchise bid without any proper thought or analysis and became a commitment which they were then obliged to implement. The other EMT schemes at Derby and Nottingham are similarly a subject for complaint, while that at Sheffield is being fiercely resisted by the entire community. All are ill conceived.

On your points below: FCC is not responsible in any way for the gates on the EMT concourse and I have no serious concerns about their gateline in the Low Level station. As far as I know those gates also work correctly with Oyster cards and there is no issue to take up with TfL. There is no need for Oyster readers on the EMT gates as the cards are not valid on their services, and FCC trains rarely use those platforms.

The problem with the EMT barrier is that it is in concept wrong, dividing the small concourse in half and imposing irrelevant universal entry and exit checks. That is also why there is so little seating and few other facilities. Arrivals information would be useful, but the practice of penning people between the barrier line and the buffer stops is absurd. The gates cannot however distinguish passengers tickets by the train they intend to join so they will go through anyway. The exit checks are just an insult to passengers when they have already been checked on train. The reality is that there was nothing wrong with the previous arrangements with manual entry control to individual platforms and free exit, which left a unified concourse with more facilities and was better in every way for the users. In my experience on-train ticket checks on the Midland Main Line are good, so there was no need for barriers which are also causing widespread congestion at busy times.

Mr M"